

APPEAL,APPEAL_NAT,CLOSED

**U.S. District Court
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS (Houston)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 4:14-cv-03241
Internal Use Only**

Patino et al v. City of Pasadena et al
Assigned to: Judge Lee H Rosenthal
Cause: 42:1973 Voting Rights Act

Date Filed: 11/12/2014
Date Terminated: 01/16/2017
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff**Alberto Patino**

represented by **Denise Hulett**
Mexican American Legal Defense & Educ.
Fund
1512 14th St
Sacramento, CA 95814
916-642-6352
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ernest I. Herrera
MALDEF
110 Broadway
Suite 300
San Antonio, TX 78205
210-224-5476
Email: eherrera@maldef.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
MALDEF
110 Broadway
Ste 300
San Antonio, TX 78205
210-224-5476
Fax: 210-224-5382
Email: nperales@maldef.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Maria Del Rosario Martinez
TERMINATED: 07/01/2015

represented by **Denise Hulett**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ernest I. Herrera
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Maria Mari

represented by **Denise Hulett**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ernest I. Herrera
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Rodolfo R Tenreiro
TERMINATED: 07/01/2015

represented by **Denise Hulett**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ernest I. Herrera
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Patricia Gonzales

represented by **Denise Hulett**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nina Perales
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

City of Pasadena

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
Bickerstaff Heath Delgado Acosta LLP
3711 S Mopac Expressway
Building One
Suite 300
Austin, TX 78746
512-472-8021
Fax: 512-320-5638
Email: bheath@bickerstaff.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kelly Spragins Sandill
Andrews Kurth LLP
600 Travis
Ste 4200
Houston, TX 77002
713-220-4181
Email: kellysandill@andrewskurth.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke

Andrews Kurth LLP
600 Travis St
Suite 4200
Houston, TX 77002-2778
713-220-3956
Fax: 713-238-7294
Email: genelocke@andrewskurth.com
TERMINATED: 04/28/2016
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist

Bickerstaff Heath Delgado Acosta LLP
3711 S. Mopac Expressway
Building One
Suite 300
Austin, TX 78746
512-472-8021
Fax: 512-320-5638
Email: gseaquist@bickerstaff.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich

Andrews Kurth
600 Travis
Ste 4200
Houston, TX 77002
713-220-4427
Email: katieahlrich@andrewskurth.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Mayor Johnny Isbell

TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Ornaldo Ybarra

represented by **Chad W Dunn**
Brazil Dunn
4201 Cypress Creek Pkwy
Ste 530
Houston, TX 77068
281-580-6310

Fax: 281-580-6362
Email: chad@brazilanddunn.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Claude Robert Heath
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Bruce Leamon
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Don Harrison
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Chad W Dunn**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Claude Robert Heath
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Pat Van Houte
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Cody Ray Wheeler

represented by **Chad W Dunn**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Claude Robert Heath
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Phil Cayten
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Steve Cote
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Darrell Morrison
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Claude Robert Heath**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gene L Locke
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gunnar Peterson Seaquist
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathryn K Ahlrich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Movant

Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong
TERMINATED: 06/21/2016

represented by **Jerad Wayne Najvar**
Najvar Law Firm
4151 Southwest Freeway
Ste 625
Houston, TX 77027
281-404-4696
Fax: 281-582-4138
Email: jerad@najvarlaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED


Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

11/12/2014	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Orinaldo Ybarra (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0541-14038368) filed by Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, Patricia Gonzales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/12/2014)
11/12/2014	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Ernest I. Herrera to Appear Pro Hac Vice by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed. Motion Docket Date 12/3/2014. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/12/2014)
11/13/2014	<u>3</u>	ORDER for Initial Pretrial and Scheduling Conference and Order to Disclose Interested Persons. Initial Conference set for 3/27/2015 at 08:45 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(Igouadi, 4) (Entered: 11/13/2014)
11/14/2014	<u>4</u>	ORDER granting <u>2</u> Motion for Ernest I. Herrera to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 11/14/2014)
11/20/2014	<u>5</u>	CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/20/2014)
12/03/2014	<u>6</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed as to Phil Cayten served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015; City of Pasadena served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015; Steve Cote served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015; Johnny Isbell served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015; Bruce Leamon served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015; Darrell Morrison served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015; Pat Van Houte served on 11/15/2014, answer due 1/14/2015, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/03/2014)
12/30/2014	<u>7</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed as to Orinaldo Ybarra served on 11/19/2014, answer due 1/20/2015, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/30/2014)
12/30/2014	<u>8</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed as to Don Harrison served on 11/19/2014, answer due 1/20/2015, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/30/2014)
12/30/2014	<u>9</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed as to Cody Ray Wheeler served on 11/19/2014, answer due 1/20/2015, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/30/2014)
01/09/2015	<u>10</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <u>1</u> Complaint, <i>Against Official-Capacity Defendants</i> by Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Orinaldo Ybarra, filed. Motion Docket Date 1/30/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Granting Motion to Dismiss Official-Capacity Defendants)(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 01/09/2015)
01/09/2015	<u>11</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Orinaldo Ybarra, filed.(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 01/09/2015)
01/09/2015	<u>12</u>	CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES by Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Orinaldo Ybarra, filed.(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 01/09/2015)
01/22/2015	<u>13</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by Don Harrison, Cody Ray Wheeler, Orinaldo Ybarra, filed.(Dunn, Chad) (Entered: 01/22/2015)
01/22/2015	<u>14</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>Unauthorized Pleadings</i> by Don Harrison, Cody Ray Wheeler, Orinaldo Ybarra, filed. Motion Docket Date 2/12/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Dunn, Chad) (Entered: 01/22/2015)
01/30/2015	<u>15</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>10</u> MOTION to Dismiss <u>1</u> Complaint, <i>Against Official-</i>

		<i>Capacity Defendants</i> , filed by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Denying City's Motion to Dismiss)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 01/30/2015)
02/03/2015	<u>16</u>	CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES by Don Harrison, Cody Ray Wheeler, Ornaldo Ybarra, filed.(Dunn, Chad) (Entered: 02/03/2015)
02/03/2015	<u>17</u>	CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PARTIES by Don Harrison, Cody Ray Wheeler, Ornaldo Ybarra, filed.(Dunn, Chad) (Entered: 02/03/2015)
02/06/2015	<u>18</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Gene L. Locke, Kathryn K. Ahlrich, Gunnar P. Seaquist on behalf of Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Ornaldo Ybarra, filed. (Heath, Claude) (Entered: 02/06/2015)
02/06/2015	<u>19</u>	RESPONSE to <u>14</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Unauthorized Pleadings</i> filed by Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Ornaldo Ybarra. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 02/06/2015)
02/13/2015	<u>20</u>	REPLY in Support of <u>10</u> MOTION to Dismiss <u>1</u> Complaint, <i>Against Official-Capacity Defendants</i> , filed by Phil Cayten, City of Pasadena, Steve Cote, Don Harrison, Johnny Isbell, Bruce Leamon, Darrell Morrison, Pat Van Houte, Cody Ray Wheeler, Ornaldo Ybarra. (Heath, Claude) (Entered: 02/13/2015)
02/18/2015	<u>21</u>	REPLY to Response to <u>14</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Unauthorized Pleadings</i> , filed by Don Harrison, Cody Ray Wheeler, Ornaldo Ybarra. (Dunn, Chad) (Entered: 02/18/2015)
03/17/2015	<u>22</u>	Joint JOINT DISCOVERY/CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 03/17/2015)
03/24/2015	<u>23</u>	Joint PROPOSED ORDER <i>Proposed Scheduling and Docket Control Order</i> , filed. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 03/24/2015)
03/27/2015	<u>24</u>	SCHEDULING AND DOCKET CONTROL ORDER. Amended Pleadings due by 9/1/2015. Joinder of Parties due by 4/10/2015 Pltf Expert Report due by 9/14/2015. Deft Expert Report due by 10/12/2015. Discovery due by 1/15/2016. Mediation due by 12/11/2015. Joint Pretrial Order due by 4/22/2016. Interim Pretrial Conference set for 10/26/2015 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Interim Pretrial Conference set for 1/18/2016 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal.vDocket Call set for 4/29/2016 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (amwilliams, 4) (Entered: 03/30/2015)
03/27/2015	25	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Initial Conference held on March 27, 2015. The court heard argument on the pending motions to dismiss the official-capacity defendants and to strike portions of the pleadings, (Docket Entry Nos. 10, 14). For the reasons stated on the record, the court granted the City's motion to dismiss the official-capacity defendants, (Docket Entry No. 10), and denied as moot the three defendants motion to strike unauthorized pleadings, (Docket Entry No. 14). The parties agreed to a schedule. A Scheduling and Docket Control Order is entered separately. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Claude Heath/Gene Locke/Chad Dunn/Rick Molina for Defts.(Court Reporter: H. Alcaraz), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 03/30/2015)
04/02/2015	<u>26</u>	Per filer, this entry made in error. See corrected entry at #27 ADMINISTRATIVE TRANSCRIPT/RECORD by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed.(Perales, Nina) Modified on 4/2/2015 (jdav, 4). (Entered: 04/02/2015)



04/02/2015	<u>27</u>	AO 435 TRANSCRIPT ORDER FORM by Nina Perales. This is to order a transcript of Initial Conference held on 3/27/2015 before Judge Lee H Rosenthal (Expedited/Original). Court Reporter/Transcriber: H. Alcaraz, filed. (jdav, 4) (Entered: 04/02/2015)
04/02/2015	<u>28</u>	Unopposed MOTION to Modify The Scheduling and Docket Control Order as to <u>24</u> Scheduling Order,, by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed. Motion Docket Date 4/23/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 04/02/2015)
04/06/2015	<u>29</u>	ORDER granting <u>28</u> Motion to Modify the Scheduling and Docket Control Order. The deadline to add new parties is extended to July 1, 2015. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 04/06/2015)
07/01/2015	<u>30</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal by Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 07/01/2015)
07/01/2015	<u>31</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal by Maria Del Rosario Martinez, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 07/01/2015)
07/01/2015	<u>32</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Leave to File Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed. Motion Docket Date 7/22/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A - First Amended Complaint Redline, # <u>2</u> Complaint Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order Proposed Order Granting Plaintiffs Motion for Leave to File First Amended Complaint to Add New Plaintiffs and Reflect Dismissal by Certain Plaintiffs)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 07/01/2015)
07/06/2015	<u>33</u>	ORDER granting <u>32</u> Motion for Leave to File First Amended Complaint. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 07/06/2015)
07/06/2015	<u>34</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against All Defendants filed by Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, Patricia Gonzales. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Maria Mari, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, Alberto Patino, Patricia Gonzales, Maria Del Rosario Martinez. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 07/06/2015)
08/11/2015	<u>35</u>	Unopposed MOTION to Modify Scheduling and Docket Control Order to Extend Deadline for Rule 26 Expert Disclosures by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 9/1/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Granting Plaintiffs' Unopposed Motion to Modify the Scheduling and Docket Control Order to Extend Deadline for Rule 26 Expert Disclosures)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 08/11/2015)
08/20/2015	<u>36</u>	ORDER granting <u>35</u> Motion to Modify Scheduling and Docket Control Order. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 08/20/2015)
08/21/2015	<u>37</u>	NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. First Interim Pretrial Conference is reset for 10/27/2015 at 08:45 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 08/21/2015)
10/26/2015	<u>38</u>	NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. Pretrial Conference reset for 10/27/2015 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. NOTE: THE CHANGE IS TO TIME ONLY. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 10/26/2015)
10/27/2015	<u>39</u>	Minute entry for proceedings before the Honorable Lee H. Rosenthal. The interim pretrial conference was held on October 27, 2015. After conferring with counsel, and for the reasons stated on the record, Plaintiffs Motion to Modify Scheduling and Docket Control Order, (Docket Entry No. 35), is granted. The court set deadlines that will be set out in a scheduling and docket control order. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Claude Heath/Gene L Locke for Defts.(Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 11/04/2015)

11/10/2015	40	AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER. Pltf Expert Witness List due by 11/16/2015. Deft Expert Witness List due by 12/16/2015. Discovery due by 2/15/2016. Mediation due by 1/11/2016. Joint Pretrial Order due by 3/25/2016. Interim Pretrial Conference set for 2/22/2016 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Docket Call set for 5/27/2016 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(cfelchak, 4) (Entered: 11/10/2015)
12/14/2015	41	MOTION for Protective Order by Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong, filed. Motion Docket Date 1/4/2016. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit subpoena, # 2 Exhibit transcript) (Najvar, Jerad) (Entered: 12/14/2015)
12/18/2015	42	NOTICE of Setting as to 41 MOTION for Protective Order. Parties notified. Discovery Hearing set for 1/8/2016 at 09:00 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 12/18/2015)
01/04/2016	43	RESPONSE in Opposition to 41 MOTION for Protective Order, filed by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Alberto Patino. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exh. A, # 2 Exhibit Exh. B, # 3 Proposed Order Proposed Order Denying Motion to Quash Subpoena and Ordering Movant to Comply with Subpoena)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/05/2016	44	Amended CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of 43 Response in Opposition to Motion, by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/07/2016	45	NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. Discovery Hearing reset for 1/25/2016 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 01/07/2016)
01/08/2016	46	Alternative Dispute Resolution STATUS REPORT by City of Pasadena. Have parties agreed to mediate? No. Mediation will occur n/a. Name of mediator: n/a, filed.(Locke, Gene) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/20/2016	47	NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. Discovery Hearing reset for 2/2/2016 at 01:30 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 01/20/2016)
02/02/2016	49	Minute entry for proceedings before the Honorable Lee H. Rosenthal. The court held a hearing on Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong's motion to quash on February 2, 2016. After conferring with counsel, and for the reasons stated on the record, the court reset the motion hearing for February 8, 2016 at 1:30 p.m. The parties will submit additional documentation in the form discussed on the record. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Jerad Najvar for Movant CKPS.(Court Reporter: K. Metzger), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 02/05/2016)
02/04/2016		***Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Discovery Hearing set for 2/8/2016 at 01:30 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal (leddins, 4) (Entered: 02/04/2016)
02/04/2016	48	Supplemental EXHIBITS re: 41 MOTION for Protective Order by Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong, filed. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit B, # 2 Exhibit D, # 3 Exhibit E, # 4 Exhibit F)(Najvar, Jerad) (Entered: 02/04/2016)
02/05/2016	50	Supplemental EXHIBITS re: 41 MOTION for Protective Order by Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong, filed. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit G-1, # 2 Exhibit G-2)(Najvar, Jerad) (Entered: 02/05/2016)
02/07/2016	51	Supplemental RESPONSE in Opposition to 41 MOTION for Protective Order, filed by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 02/07/2016)
02/08/2016	52	NOTICE of Setting. Parties notified. Discovery Hearing set for 2/10/2016 at 01:30 PM

		in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 02/08/2016)
02/08/2016	57	Minute entry for proceedings before the Honorable Lee H. Rosenthal. The initial conference was held on February 8, 2016. The court heard argument on Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong's motion for a protective order, (Docket Entry No. 41). After conferring with counsel, and for the reasons stated on the record, the court will review in camera the documents that are the subject of the motion. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Jerad Najvar for Movant.(Court Reporter: L. Wells), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/10/2016	53	REPLY in Support of 41 MOTION for Protective Order, filed by Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong. (Najvar, Jerad) (Entered: 02/10/2016)
02/10/2016	54	NOTICE of Errata/Clarification regarding Reply in support of re: 41 MOTION for Protective Order by Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong, filed. (Najvar, Jerad) (Entered: 02/10/2016)
02/10/2016	58	Minute entry for proceedings before the Honorable Lee H. Rosenthal. The initial conference was held on February 12, 2016. After conferring with counsel, and for the reasons stated on the record, the court denied in part and granted in part Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong's motion for a protective order, (Docket Entry No. 41). Citizens to Keep Pasadena Strong and Citizens for Positive Change will produce documents to Patino subject to the limitations discussed on the record. The court extended all non-expired deadlines by 60 days, which will be set out in a scheduling and docket control order Appearances: Jerad Wayne Najvar, Nina Perales, Ernest I. Herrera.(Court Reporter: L. Wells), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 02/26/2016)
02/12/2016	55	AMENDED SCHEDULING AND DOCKET CONTROL ORDER. Discovery due by 4/15/2016. Interim Pretrial Conference set for 4/22/2016 at 8:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Rosenthal. Pretrial Motion Filing due by 5/24/2016. Joint Pretrial Order and Motion in Limine due by 7/19/2016. Docket Call set for 7/26/2016 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(olindor, 4) (Entered: 02/16/2016)
02/17/2016		***Set/Reset Hearings: Interim Pretrial Conference set for 4/22/2016 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal (leddins, 4) (Entered: 02/17/2016)
02/24/2016	56	AO 435 TRANSCRIPT REQUEST by Nina Perales for Transcript of 02/10/2016, Judge Lee Rosenthal. Expedited (7 days) turnaround requested. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Laura Wells, filed. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 02/24/2016)
02/28/2016	 59	TRANSCRIPT re: Discovery Hearing held on February 10, 2016 before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Laura Wells. Ordering Party Nina Perales Release of Transcript Restriction set for 5/31/2016., filed. (lwells,) (Entered: 02/28/2016)
02/29/2016	60	Notice of Filing of Official Transcript as to 59 Transcript. Party notified, filed. (hcarr, 4) (Entered: 02/29/2016)
03/03/2016	61	Opposed MOTION for Entry of Order re: Protective Order Regarding Political Committee and Political Consultant Documents by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 3/24/2016. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - Protective Order, # 2 Exhibit B - Transcript of Hearing, # 3 Proposed Order Proposed Order)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 03/03/2016)
03/15/2016	62	Joint MOTION for Protective Order by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 4/5/2016. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - Protective Order, # 2 Exhibit B - Transcript of Hearing, # 3 Proposed Order)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 03/15/2016)

03/23/2016	<u>63</u>	ORDER granting <u>62</u> Joint MOTION for Protective Order. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(olindor, 4) (Entered: 03/23/2016)
03/23/2016	<u>64</u>	PROTECTIVE ORDER (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Acknowledgement of Confidentiality and Protective Order) Parties notified.(olindor, 4) (Entered: 03/23/2016)
04/12/2016	<u>65</u>	Unopposed MOTION to Modify Scheduling and Docket Control Order by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 5/3/2016. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Granting Motion to Modify Scheduling and Docket Control Order) (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 04/12/2016)
04/21/2016	<u>66</u>	ORDER granting <u>65</u> Unopposed MOTION to Modify Scheduling and Docket Control Order. Discovery due by 5/31/2016. Non-Dispositive Motion Filing due by 7/22/2016. Joint Pretrial Order due by 9/16/2016. Pretrial Conference set for 6/21/2016 at 08:30 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Docket Call set for 9/26/2016 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(olindor, 4) (Entered: 04/22/2016)
04/25/2016	<u>67</u>	Unopposed MOTION to Substitute Counsel by City of Pasadena, filed. Motion Docket Date 5/16/2016. (Locke, Gene) (Entered: 04/25/2016)
04/27/2016	<u>68</u>	ORDER granting <u>67</u> Motion to Substitute. Kelly Sandill is substituted for Gene Locke. (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(jdav, 4) (Entered: 04/28/2016)
06/09/2016	<u>69</u>	NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. Pretrial Conference reset for 6/21/2016 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. NOTE: THE CHANGE IS TO TIME ONLY. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 06/09/2016)
06/21/2016	70	Minute entry for proceedings before the Honorable Lee H. Rosenthal. A pretrial conference was held on June 21, 2016. The parties are proceeding with discovery in accordance with the courts scheduling and docket control order. The court will hear oral argument on Pasadenas motion for summary judgment on August 24, 2016 at 8:30 a.m. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Claude Heath/Kelly Sandill for Defts.(Court Reporter: B. Slavin), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 06/28/2016)
07/01/2016	<u>71</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by City of Pasadena, filed. Motion Docket Date 7/22/2016. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix File 1 - Pages 1 to 71, # <u>2</u> Appendix File 2 - Pages 72 to 106, # <u>3</u> Appendix File 3 - Pages 107 to 212, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Brief in Support, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order)(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 07/01/2016)
07/12/2016	<u>72</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time Response to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 8/2/2016. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Granting Unopposed Motion)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 07/12/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>73</u>	ORDER Granting <u>72</u> Plaintiff's Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time Response to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment (Plaintiff's Responses due by 7/29/2016.)(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(jguajardo, 4) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/30/2016	<u>74</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 8/22/2016. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 07/30/2016)
07/30/2016	<u>75</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition to <u>71</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment , filed by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Statement of Undisputed and Disputed Facts, # <u>2</u> Affidavit Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera in Support of Plaintiffs' Response, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibits 1 - 11 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibits 12 - 16 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibits 17 - 20 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Exhibits 21 - 27 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # <u>7</u> Exhibit





		Exhibits 28 - 39 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # 8 Exhibit Exhibits 40 - 42 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # 9 Exhibit Exhibits 43 - 44 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # 10 Exhibit Exhibits 45 - 48 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # 11 Exhibit Exhibits 49 - 51 to Affidavit of Ernest I. Herrera, # 12 Affidavit Affidavit of Cody Ray Wheeler, # 13 Affidavit Affidavit of Orinaldo Ybarra, # 14 Affidavit Affidavit of Don Harrison, # 15 Affidavit Expert Declaration of Andres Tijerina)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 07/30/2016)
08/01/2016	76	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Memorandum of Law in Response to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino, filed. Motion Docket Date 8/22/2016. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order Granting Unopposed Motion for Extension of Time)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 08/01/2016)
08/01/2016	77	ORDER granting 76 Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Memorandum of Law in Response to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment (Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(olindor, 4) (Entered: 08/02/2016)
08/09/2016	78	REPLY to Response to 71 MOTION for Summary Judgment , filed by City of Pasadena. (Heath, Claude) (Entered: 08/09/2016)
08/11/2016	79	OBJECTIONS to and Motion to Strike Defendant's Summary Judgment Evidence, filed by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Proposed Order Granting Motion to Strike)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 08/11/2016)
08/18/2016	80	RESPONSE to 79 Objections, and Motion to Strike Defendant's Summary Judgment Evidence, filed by City of Pasadena. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibits 1-3, # 2 Proposed Order)(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 08/18/2016)
08/22/2016	81	REPLY in Support of Plaintiffs' Objections to and Motion to Strike Defendant's Summary Judgment Evidence, filed by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - Deposition Excerpt - Dr. Rives)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 08/22/2016)
08/22/2016	82	ORDER granting 74 Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(rosaldana, 4) (Entered: 08/23/2016)
08/24/2016	87	Minute entry for proceedings before the Honorable Lee H. Rosenthal. A motion hearing was held on August 24, 2016. The court heard oral argument on the plaintiffs motion to strike, (Docket Entry No. 79), and the City's motion for summary judgment, (Docket Entry No. 71). For the reasons stated in detail on the record, the court granted the plaintiffs motion to strike and denied the City's motion for summary judgment. The parties will file a joint pretrial order by October 21, 2016. Docket call will be held October 26, 2016 at 8:30 a.m. in Courtroom 11-B. Trial will begin November 15, 2016 at 9:00 a.m. in Courtroom 11-B. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlrich/Claude Heath/Kelly Sandill for Defts. (Court Reporter: K. Metzger), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 08/29/2016)
08/26/2016	83	NOTICE by City of Pasadena, filed. (Locke, Gene) (Entered: 08/26/2016)
08/26/2016	84	AO 435 TRANSCRIPT REQUEST by Nina Perales for Transcript of MSJ Hearing on 8/24/16 before Judge Rosenthal. Expedited (7 days) turnaround requested. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Kathy Metzger, filed. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 08/26/2016)
08/26/2016	85	NOTICE <i>Certifiate of Deposition - Andy Helms</i> by City of Pasadena, filed. (Locke, Gene) (Entered: 08/26/2016)
08/26/2016	86	NOTICE <i>Certificate of Deposition - Cary Bass</i> by City of Pasadena, filed. (Locke, Gene) (Entered: 08/26/2016)
08/30/2016		TRANSCRIPT re: Excerpt of Motion Hearing held on 8/24/2016 before Judge Lee H




	 88	Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber K. Metzger. Ordering Party Kathryn K. Ahlrich Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/28/2016. filed. (kmetzger) (Entered: 08/30/2016)
08/30/2016	 89	TRANSCRIPT re: Motion Hearing held on 8/24/2016 before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber K. Metzger. Ordering Party Nina Perales Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/28/2016, filed. (kmetzger) (Entered: 08/30/2016)
08/31/2016	90	Notice of Filing of Official Transcript as to 88 Transcript, 89 Transcript. Party notified, filed. (hcarr, 4) (Entered: 08/31/2016)
09/23/2016	91	NOTICE of Resetting. Parties notified. Docket Call reset for 10/26/2016 at 03:30 PM in Courtroom 11B before Judge Lee H Rosenthal, filed. NOTE: The change is to Time only. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 09/23/2016)
10/19/2016	92	MOTION for Denise Hulett to Appear Pro Hac Vice by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Maria Del Rosario Martinez, Alberto Patino, Rodolfo R Tenreiro, filed. Motion Docket Date 11/9/2016. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 10/19/2016)
10/20/2016	93	ORDER granting 92 Motion for Denise Hulett to Appear Pro Hac Vice.(Signed by Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(gkelner, 4) (Entered: 10/20/2016)
10/22/2016	94	PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM by Patricia Gonzales, Maria Mari, Alberto Patino (Attachments: # 1 Plaintiffs' Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, # 2 Plaintiffs' Pretrial Memorandum of Law, # 3 Plaintiffs' Trial Witness List, # 4 List of Plaintiffs' Witness Names Copy 1, # 5 List of Plaintiffs' Witness Names Copy 2, # 6 Plaintiffs' Exhibit List Copy 1, # 7 Plaintiffs' Exhibit List Copy 2, # 8 Defendant's Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, # 9 Defendant's Pretrial Memorandum of Law, # 10 Defendant's Trial Witness List, # 11 List of Defendant's Witness Names Copy 1, # 12 List of Defendant's Witness Names Copy 2, # 13 Defendant's Exhibit List Copy 1, # 14 Defendant's Exhibit List Copy 2)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 10/22/2016)
10/26/2016	95	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Docket call held October 26, 2016. Trial will begin November 16, 2016, at 10:00 AM. If trial is not concluded by November 18, it will recommence on November 28. Appearances: Kathryn K Ahlrich, Claude Robert Heath, Nina Perales, Ernest I. Herrera.(Court Reporter: K. Miller), filed.(arrivera, 4) (Entered: 10/31/2016)
11/03/2016	96	First Exhibit List by City of Pasadena(Sandill, Kelly) (Entered: 11/03/2016)
11/03/2016	97	Supplemental Exhibit List by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/03/2016)
11/08/2016	98	Supplemental Exhibit List by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/08/2016)
11/09/2016	99	Supplemental Exhibit List by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/09/2016)
11/10/2016	100	Supplemental Exhibit List by City of Pasadena(Sandill, Kelly) (Entered: 11/10/2016)
11/10/2016	101	Supplemental Exhibit List by City of Pasadena(Ahlrich, Kathryn) (Entered: 11/10/2016)
11/10/2016	102	NOTICE <i>Of Plaintiffs' Objections to Defendant's Trial Exhibits</i> by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino, filed. (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/10/2016)
11/15/2016	103	Supplemental Exhibit List by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/15/2016)

11/15/2016	<u>104</u>	Supplemental Exhibit List by City of Pasadena(Ahlich, Kathryn) (Entered: 11/15/2016)
11/16/2016	<u>105</u>	Supplemental Exhibit List by Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/16/2016)
11/17/2016	<u>106</u>	Supplemental Exhibit List by Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/17/2016)
11/17/2016	108	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day ONE of Bench Trial held November 17, 2016. The plaintiff's objections to defendants' trial exhibits, Docket Entry No. 102, are denied as moot. The parties presented opening statements. Mr. David Ely, Dr. Richard Engstrom, and Dr. Andres Tijerina testified. Court adjourned until November 18, at 9:00 am. Appearances:Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and. Kathryn Ahlich/Gunnar Seaquist/Claude Heath/Kelly Sandill for Defts. (Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed.(leddins, 4) Modified on 12/2/2016 (leddins, 4). Modified on 12/2/2016 (leddins, 4). (Entered: 11/22/2016)
11/18/2016	<u>107</u>	Supplemental Exhibit List by Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 11/18/2016)
11/18/2016	109	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day TWO of Bench Trial held November 18, 2016. Testimony continued. Councilman Orlando Ybarra and Mayor David Isbell testified. Court adjourned till November 28, 2016, at 1:00 p.m.Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlich/Gunner Seaquist/Claude Heath/Kelly Sandill for Defts. (Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed. (leddins, 4) Modified on 12/2/2016 (leddins, 4). (Entered: 11/22/2016)
11/28/2016	110	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day THREE of Bench Trial held November 28, 2016. Testimony continued. Mayor Johnny Isbell testified. Court adjourned until November 29, 2016, at 8:30 a.m. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlich/Gunnar Seaquist/ Claude Heath/Kelley Sandhill for Defts.(Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 12/02/2016)
11/29/2016	111	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day FOUR of Bench Trial held November 29, 2016. Testimony continued. Councilwoman Pat Van Houte, Former Councilman Don Harrison, Director of Community Relations Richard Scott, and Councilman Cary Bass testified. Court adjourned until November 30, 2016, at 8:30 a.m. in Courtroom 11-D. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlich/Claude Heath/ Gunnar Seaquist/Kelly Sandill for Defts. (Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 12/02/2016)
11/30/2016	113	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day FIVE of Bench Trial held November 30, 2016. Testimony continued. Councilman Cary Bass, Director of Financial Planning Andy Helms, Bianca Gracia, Councilman Cody Ray Wheeler, and Oscar Del Toro testified. Court adjourned until December 1, 2016, at 8:45 a.m. in Courtroom 11-B. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlich/Claude Heath/Gunnar Seaquist/Kelly Sandill for Deft. (Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 12/06/2016)
12/01/2016	114	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day SIX of Bench Trial held December 1, 2016. Testimony continued. Victor Villarreal, Dr. Norfleet Rives, and Dr. John Alford testified. Court adjourned until December 2, 2016, at 8:30 a.m Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlich/Claude Heath/Gunnar Seaquist/Kelly Sandill for Defts. (Court Reporter: M. Malone), filed. (leddins, 4) (Entered: 12/06/2016)
12/02/2016	<u>112</u>	Supplemental Exhibit List by Alberto Patino(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/02/2016)
12/02/2016	116	Minute entry for proceedings before the Hon. Lee H. Rosenthal. Day SEVEN of Bench Trial held December 2, 2016. The parties presented closing arguments. Trial concluded. The plaintiffs must submit a final amended exhibit list by the end of the

		day December 2, 2016. The parties must file their proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law by December 14, 2016. Appearances: Nina Perales/Ernest Herrera for Pltfs. and Kathryn Ahlrich/Claude Heath/Gunnar Seaquist/Kelly Sandill for Defts. (Court Reporter: M.Malone), filed.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 12/06/2016)
12/06/2016	<u>115</u>	Exhibit List and TRIAL EXHIBITS by City of Pasadena (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit, # <u>5</u> Exhibit, # <u>6</u> Exhibit, # <u>7</u> Exhibit, # <u>8</u> Exhibit) (Sandill, Kelly) Modified on 12/12/2016 (leddins, 4). (Entered: 12/06/2016)
12/08/2016	<u>117</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>115</u> Exhibit List by City of Pasadena (Sandill, Kelly) (Entered: 12/08/2016)
12/09/2016	<u>118</u>	Supplemental Exhibit List by City of Pasadena(Ahlrich, Kathryn) (Entered: 12/09/2016)
12/09/2016	<u>119</u>	Supplemental EXHIBITS re: <u>118</u> Exhibit List by City of Pasadena (Ahlrich, Kathryn) (Entered: 12/09/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>120</u>	Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1-10, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 11-20, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 21-28, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 29 part 1, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 29 part 2, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 30-40, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 41-45, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 46-50)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>121</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 51-55, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 56-60, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 62-63, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 64, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 65-69, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 70, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 71, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 72, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 73, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 74, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 75) (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>122</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 76, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 77, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 78, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 79, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 80, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 81, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 82, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 83, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 84, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 85, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 86, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 87, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 88, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 89, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 90)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>123</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 91-93, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 94 part 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 94 part 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 95, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 96, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 97, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 98, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 99, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 100)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>124</u>	<i>Submission of Evidence Pursuant to Court Order</i> by Alberto Patino, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>125</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 101, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 102, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 103-104, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 105, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 106, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 107, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 108, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 109, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 110, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 111, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 112, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 113, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 114, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 115, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 116, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 117, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 118, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 119, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 120, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 121, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 122, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 123, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 124, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 125)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/12/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>129</u>	DEFENDANT'S Exhibit List by City of Pasadena. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/12/2016	<u>130</u>	Plaintiff's Exhibit List by Patricia Gonzales. (wbostic, 4) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>126</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 126, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 127, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 128, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 129, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 130, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 131-153, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 154 part 1, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 154 part 2, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 154 part 3)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>127</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 155 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 155 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 155 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 155 part 4, # <u>5</u> Errata 155 part 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 156 part 1, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 156 part 2)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)

		12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>128</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 157 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 157 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 157 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 157 part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 157 part 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 158 part 1, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 158 part 2, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 158 part 3, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 158 part 4, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 158 part 5)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>131</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 159 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 159 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 159 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 159 part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 159 part 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 160, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 161 part 1, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 161 part 2, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 162 part 1, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 162 part 2, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 163)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>132</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 164 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 164 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 164 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 164 part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 164 part 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 164 part 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 165 part 1, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 165 part 2, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 165 part 3)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>133</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 166 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 166 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 166 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 167 part 1, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 167 part 2, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 167 part 3, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 168)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>134</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 169 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 169 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 169 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 169 part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 169 part 5)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>135</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 169 part 6, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 169 part 7, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 169 part 8, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 169 part 9, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 169 part 10)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>136</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 170 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 170 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 170 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 170 part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 170 part 5)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/13/2016	<u>137</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 171-173, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 176-177, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 178-181, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 185, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 187, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 190-192, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 193, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 194-200)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/13/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>138</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 201-208, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 209 part 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 209 part 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 210-211, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 213-215)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>139</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 216 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 216 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 216 part 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 216 part 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 216 part 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 217, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 218, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 219, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 220)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>140</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 221, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 222, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 223, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 224, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 225)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>141</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 226, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 227, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 228, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 229, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 230)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>142</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 231, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 232-233, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 235-239, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 241-245, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 246-250, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 252-258, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 259 part 1, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 259 part 2)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)

12/14/2016	<u>143</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 261-270, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 271-280, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 281-290, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 291-300, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 301-311)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>144</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 312 part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 312 part 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 313-320, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 330, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 331-340)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>145</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 341, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 342-346, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 347-348)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>146</u>	Trial EXHIBITS re: <u>120</u> Exhibit List by Alberto Patino (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 101, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 102, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 103-104, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 105, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 106, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 107, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 108, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 109, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 110, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 111, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 112, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 113, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 114, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 115, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 116, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 117, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 118, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 119, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 120, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 121, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 122, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 123, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 124, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 125)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>147</u>	SUPPLEMENT by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino, filed. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/14/2016	<u>148</u>	Proposed Findings of Fact/Conclusions of Law by City of Pasadena(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 12/14/2016)
12/15/2016	<u>149</u>	Proposed Findings of Fact/Conclusions of Law by Patricia Gonzales, Alberto Patino (Perales, Nina) (Entered: 12/15/2016)
12/16/2016	<u>150</u>	SUPPLEMENT to <u>145</u> Exhibits by City of Pasadena, filed.(Ahlrich, Kathryn) (Entered: 12/16/2016)
01/06/2017	<u>151</u>	MEMORANDUM AND OPINION entered: The City of Pasadena, Texas is ordered to conduct its May 2017 City Council elections using the map and plan in force in May 2013. The court retains jurisdiction under 52 U.S.C. § 10302(c) to review before enforcement any voting qualification, prerequisite, practice, or procedure different from the map and plan in use in May 2013. Any new City Council voting map, plan, or procedure may be enforced before court review only if it has first been submitted to the United States Attorney General and the Attorney General has not interposed an objection within 60 days after submission. The parties must submit a proposed form of injunction and a proposed period for continued jurisdiction no later than January 13, 2017.(Signed by Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified.(leddins, 4) (Entered: 01/06/2017)
01/11/2017	 <u>152</u>	TRANSCRIPT re: Day One of Bench Trial held on November 17, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017., filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/11/2017	 <u>153</u>	TRANSCRIPT re: Day Two of Bench Trial held on November 18, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017., filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/11/2017	 <u>154</u>	TRANSCRIPT re: Day Three of Bench Trial held on November 28, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017., filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/11/2017	 <u>155</u>	TRANSCRIPT re: Day Four of Bench Trial held on November 29, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017.,

		filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/11/2017	 156	TRANSCRIPT re: Day Five of Bench Trial held on November 30, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017., filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/11/2017	 157	TRANSCRIPT re: Day Six of Bench Trial held on December 1, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017., filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/11/2017	 158	TRANSCRIPT re: Day Seven of Bench Trial held on December 2, 2016 before Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal. Court Reporter/Transcriber Mayra Malone. Ordering Party Nina Perales and Kelly Sandill Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2017., filed. (mmalone,) (Entered: 01/11/2017)
01/12/2017	159	Notice of Filing of Official Transcript as to 155 Transcript, 154 Transcript, 153 Transcript, 158 Transcript, 156 Transcript, 157 Transcript, 152 Transcript,. Party notified, filed. (hcarr, 4) (Entered: 01/12/2017)
01/13/2017	160	PROPOSED ORDER <i>Proposed Final Judgment and Injunction</i> , filed.(Perales, Nina) (Entered: 01/13/2017)
01/13/2017	161	ADVISORY by City of Pasadena, filed.(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 01/13/2017)
01/16/2017	162	FINAL JUDGMENT AND ORDER OF INJUNCTION (Signed by Chief Judge Lee H Rosenthal) Parties notified. (nochsner, 4) (Entered: 01/16/2017)
01/17/2017	163	NOTICE OF APPEAL to US Court of Appeals for the Fifth Circuit re: 162 Final Judgment by City of Pasadena (Filing fee \$ 505, receipt number 0541-17793717), filed. (Heath, Claude) (Entered: 01/17/2017)
01/17/2017	164	MOTION to Stay by City of Pasadena, filed. Motion Docket Date 2/7/2017. (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Order)(Heath, Claude) (Entered: 01/17/2017)